The Gender of Globalization

Introduction

Nandini Gunewardena and Ann Kingsolver

The gender of globalization has been obscured by "neutral" analytical lenses that overlook the powerful incongruity between women's key roles in the global labor force and their social and economic marginalization, as well as their persistent efforts to navigate the processes that produce this incongruity. Our main concern in this volume is to understand, via the lenses of gender and cultural analysis, the ways in which women participate in, become drawn and incorporated into, are affected by, and negotiate their encounters with contemporary forms of global economic restructuring commonly referred to as globalization. We bring together ethnographic case studies from diverse locations in the global South and the global North, analyzing economic globalization as a *gendered* process. Our purpose is to move beyond the naturalization of gender in our analysis of globalization;[1] we illustrate how local and global constructions of gender are employed in the operations of transnational capital to exacerbate women's economic and social vulnerabilities.[2] Collectively, the ethnographic case studies in this volume analyze globalization not merely as an innocuous and inevitable (see Gibson-Graham 1996) historical phenomenon, but also as a set of processes with distinct, gender-specific implications. These ethnographic essays "pivot the center" (Collins 1991) by focusing on the "subjective," agentive perspectives of those who are most marginalized by capitalist

COPYRIGHTED MATERIAL www.sarpress.sarweb.org

globalization, rather than on the "objectifying" language of econometric analyses. By using ethnographic methods, the authors (from several disciplines) illuminate the often invisible dimensions of social and economic disempowerment that women encounter in globalization, contrary to the arguments put forward by globalization's proponents. We seek to document the complex realities of women's lives, often referred to as the hidden face of globalization, masked by the impressive macroeconomic performance measures that have rallied the fervent devotees of globalization.

The ethnographic essays collected here tell of disruptions fueled by globalization in the situated lives and lived experiences of women, from their own perspectives.[3] We illustrate the confluences of gender, race, ethnicity, class, caste, color, religion, and regional ascriptions within the construction of marginality in specific social contexts and examine the interactions and intersections of these axes of differentiation between local and global constituencies. Simultaneously, we argue that the increasing and deepening economic marginality experienced disproportionately by women in globalized contexts does not necessarily rob them of their capacity for agency, individually or collectively.

The analytical vantage point of this volume, then, questions normative notions of agency and augments the body of feminist literature that explores its paradoxical aspects, by illustrating the complex and contradictory ways in which women's agency and subordination are manifested. The insights on women's agentive acts documented in this volume strengthen feminist understandings of the divergent ways in which women confront material oppression and of the multifaceted dimensions of agency. In this manner, this volume deconstructs several monolithic, unitary concepts—the naturalization of gender in globalization, the uniform effects of globalization, the essentialist notions of gender, identity, and location (for example, what constitutes the local, as compared with the global, and the global North versus the global South), the homogeneity of power and oppression, and the singularity of agency (as always leading to empowerment). Our concern is to show how the operations of capitalist globalization have led to uneven shifts and reconfigurations of these categories beyond binaries and universals.

Collectively, these chapters provide insights into women's own assessments of social and economic marginality and the wide range of strategies they deploy in challenging and subverting their subordination. We strive to provide insights into the diversity of women's experiences of marginality as we highlight the parallels and differences in the ways in which they travel

 COPYRIGHTED MATERIAL www.sarpress.sarweb.org

across the spaces and processes often conceptually elided as the global North or South, gendered experience, and globalization. That is why we discuss plural globalizations and plural marginalities in this volume.[4] As such, the ethnographic cases document the different trajectories women traverse in straddling the various social and political borders they encounter and the often parallel, sometimes different, strategies they resort to in defending their integrity and defining their identities as autonomous beings. We use the notion of "navigation" to refer to the myriad encounters women grapple with in globalized contexts and their efforts to exercise agency *within constraints*. The ethnographic material in this collection provides a far more nuanced understanding of agency, beyond the reduction of agency to empowerment.

The ethnographic analyses trace how emergent forms of marginality are related to and build on existing forms and bases of power, subordination, and disempowerment. Many authors in this volume incorporate a Foucaultian (see Foucault 1979) understanding of power relations—in this case, capitalist power relations—as constantly asserted and contested in daily interactions. To this end, the authors explore reconceptualizations of marginality that problematize fixed "margins," given the emerging evidence of the diverse strategies women deploy to make these margins more malleable. The use of the ethnographic approach allows incisive documentation of such assertions and contestations, and that is the central contribution of this project to the broader conversation on globalization. In addition to the multiple vantage points of the authors (many from marginalized social locations themselves), the voices of and interpretations by women marginalized by globalization come to the fore in this book as women narrate their own experiences.

ORIENTATIONS AND DIRECTIONS

We are indebted to feminist anthropologists who have articulated foundational ideas that guide our analyses. Key works include those on the cultural construction of gender (for example, as collected by Gero and Conkey [1991]; Reiter [1976]; and Rosaldo and Lamphere [1974]; and discussed by Visweswaran [1997]), women's work and relationship to capital and capitalism (for example, Nash 1979; Sacks/Brodkin 1974, 1979), and the political economy of gender and globalization as historically contingent and reflected in the material realities, social institutions, and cultural ideologies that shape women's incorporation into globalization in relational and unequal manners along markers of race, ethnicity, caste, and class.[5] Our use of the lens of gender includes documentation of both men

COPYRIGHTED MATERIAL www.sarpress.sarweb.org

and women's experiences in analyses of gender and globalization (see Derné 2002; Gutmann 1997). Many feminist anthropologists, as well as scholars in related fields,[6] have documented how the current wave of economic globalization (with its neoliberal governance) has had disproportionately negative impacts on women in terms of aggravating women's social and economic marginality.[7]

The landmark volume on globalization by Fröbel, Heinrichs, and Kreye (1980) discusses a significant instance of capitalist globalization in the twentieth century—the emergence of export-oriented industrialization in the 1970s chartered by transnational corporations (TNCs) and spurred by neoliberal economic policies. The three decades since have proven that women, placed as low-end, poorly paid, assembly-line workers, have been critical for the burgeoning growth of export processing and production for a global market. Rapid technological developments in the communication and transportation sectors in the 1980s hastened the processes of globalization even as the widespread importation of neoliberal economic philosophies facilitated the liberalization of markets in production, trade, and finances. Attesting to the multiplication of TNCs during this period, Sassen (2006) documents how foreign direct investment (FDI), the magic bullet formula of neoliberal economics instrumental in propagating export production (via TNCs), grew three times faster in the 1980s than export trade.[8] Yet, contrary to predictions, particularly those related to the now highly contested "trickle-down" economic theory, economic globalization has deepened rather than narrowed the social and economic divides between the global North and South, as documented even by leading economists such as the former chief economist for the World Bank, Joseph Stiglitz (2002). Less well documented are the particularly damning gendered consequences of globalization—a lacuna this volume attempts to fill.[9]

Given that women represent more than 80 percent of the unskilled labor force in transnational production and services, Sassen's discussion of not only the exponential growth of TNCs but also their strategic role in the globalized world economy signals the daunting implications for our understanding of women's increasing roles in economic globalization. As she notes, "by far the largest numbers of affiliates [of TNCs] are in developing countries, because they are a mechanism for TNCs to enter the global South. Their number went from 71,300 in 1990 to 580,638 in 2003" (Sassen 2006:27).

During the 1980s and 1990s, scholars from a range of social science disciplines—notably, anthropologists and sociologists intrigued by the implications of the large-scale recruitment of young single women by trans-

 COPYRIGHTED MATERIAL www.sarpress.sarweb.org

national firms—documented various aspects of women's productive work within globalized contexts. In the new millennium, however, we understand globalization from a broader perspective—within and across locations—as determined by, as well as influencing, transnational labor migrations (legal and illegal, such as trafficking), agentive consumption (in addition to production) practices, entrepreneurial activities, and collective organizational efforts. Women's overrepresentation in these global circuits, including the impoverishing role of macroeconomic policies such as structural adjustment, trade liberalization, and FDI that compel women to participate in the global economy, has also been previously discussed by Sassen (2006), Harrison (1997a), and Chant and Craske (2002), among others.

This literature amply documents how these policies have reduced local purchasing power parity and subsistence security and led women to adopt compensation strategies at the expense of their self-exploitation to ensure household and family survival. A World Bank (2006) document on revenue generated by transnational immigrants (predominantly a female workforce) reveals a staggering figure of $230 billion in global remittances. The chapters in this volume add to this body of literature, analyzing how these processes are distinctly gendered. The richly textured descriptions of the lived realities of women experiencing these forces illustrate how women of diverse ethnic, racial, caste, class, and other identities (as well as intersectional social locations) encounter and respond to the forces of globalization in unique and differentiated ways.

Scholars interested in the economics of globalization, particularly from a macroeconomic perspective, including issues related to those discussed above, will find Sassen's volume and other texts of great interest. In contrast, the purpose of this volume is to address the range of concerns that the macroeconomic perspective does not illuminate. As Benería notes (2003:40), the very recent incorporation of feminist theory in the field of economics, for example, with the establishment of the International Association for Feminist Economics in 1992,[10] has brought new attention to women's unpaid and undercounted labor. This is a significant shift because macroeconomic data often obscure the detrimental aspects of globalization, experienced particularly by society's most marginalized members.

MAPPING THE SPECIFICS OF GLOBALIZATION

Our use of the term *globalization* builds on the definition outlined by Appadurai (1996), Inda and Rosaldo (2002), Naples and Desai (2002), Lewellen (2002), and others as a set of social and economic processes that entail intensified global interconnectedness (and subsequent changes in

COPYRIGHTED MATERIAL www.sarpress.sarweb.org

local livelihoods), via the mobility and flows of culture, capital, information, resistance, technologies, production, people, commodities, images, and ideologies. Contemporary processes of globalization in their cultural and economic manifestations can well be considered the most formidable forces of the twenty-first century. The intensification of late-modern capital's fluidity and mobility, the deregulation of trade, the widespread influence of neoliberal logic, and the ensuing cultural and economic transformations that constitute globalization merit further inquiry, especially in terms of their implications for women's well-being and survival. Emerging evidence suggests that, contrary to the economic gains and social benefits women are expected to reap from their engagement in a global economy, women's incorporation into global production systems and forms of cultural representation has worked counter to their well-being, survival, security, autonomy, and empowerment.

A sizeable body of analytical work produced on globalization over the past several decades generates insights into the myriad processes that are labeled, in much too totalizing a way (Gibson-Graham 1996), as "globalization." Anthropologists, including Wolf (1982) and Drake (1987, 1990), have demonstrated that the globalization of capitalist relations is not new and that assertions of marginality written into the history of global capitalism must be met with counterhistories that feature the specific mechanisms of capitalist subjugation and narratives that do not naturalize Europe and the United States as the world's "center." In this project, we join those theorists who have focused on problems associated with development and the "global factory" (including the human rights violation of offering less than a living wage) and stemming from capitalist logic and practice (see Robbins 2005; Rothstein and Blim 1991; Ward 1990). Critical Marxian analyses of capitalism, far from being outdated, have never been more relevant than in the current moment (see Nash 1997; Roseberry 1997; Wood 1997).

As many scholars have argued (see Alexander and Mohanty 1996; Brodkin 2000; Buck 2002; Collins 1998a; Harrison 1995, 1997a, 1997b, 2002; hooks 1984; Kingsolver 2001; Mohanty 2003a; Sarker and De 2002; Steady 2002; Torres, Mirón, and Inda 1999; Yelvington 1995; Zavella 1997), research on globalization must consider the central role of racial/ethnic exploitation in capitalist globalization and the intersection of gender with other markers of difference and subjugation, such as race, ethnicity, class, and caste. Given the widening social and economic disparities evidenced in the processes of globalization and the new and redemarcated lines of social stratification implicated in such processes, we are compelled to consider the multiple and overlapping systems of subordination and exploitation

 COPYRIGHTED MATERIAL www.sarpress.sarweb.org

that have emerged or been reified in globalized contexts, especially in the global South.[11] The case studies included in this volume explore the dynamics by which ascriptions of gender, race, ethnicity, class, caste, color, religion, and regional locations in the global South and North are configured in specific social contexts to construct marginality. They inform us of the particular contours of local disparities created by the interaction and intersection of the aforementioned axes of differentiation, and of the socioeconomic power differentials between local and global constituencies.

DELINEATING DIFFERENCE AND MARGINALITY IN GLOBALIZATION

The theoretical conversation engaged by this volume puts forward an explanatory framework for understanding local and global patterns of hierarchization of needs and social valuations formed by globalization along axes of gender, race, ethnicity, class, caste, color, and regional location. Our collection addresses several questions on the dynamics of gendered marginality and disempowerment evidenced in the current manifestations of economic globalization (for example, under neoliberal policy regimes). Individual chapters document the shifting ways in which women currently participate in or are incorporated into local and local-global workforces, as well as women's perceptions of their positioning in economies reconfigured through globalization. Several chapters document the new and sometimes worsened forms of vulnerabilities to which women are subjected, ensuing from threats to their survival and well-being in contemporary forms of economic globalization; others denote processes that lead to the creation and deepening of social distance and exclusionary practices, locally and globally; and some document the ways that women are critiquing (and finding alternatives to) capitalist rationales for organizing social and economic relations and employing alternative logics successfully in resistance movements.

The reconstructions, redefinitions, alternative representations, and reconfigurations of women's roles ushered in by the dramatic restructuring of economic and social orders illustrate the lack of uniformity in the unfolding of globalization processes. While emerging reports continue to document the widening social and economic disparities set in motion by globalization, the ethnographic material in this volume provides vivid accounts of the multiple ways in which such disparities affect women's lives and, in turn, women's divergent responses to the disempowering consequences of globalization. Women's confrontations with these processes lead us to further examine the hegemonic nature of transnational economic

COPYRIGHTED MATERIAL www.sarpress.sarweb.org

structures, policies, and practices that embody neoliberal economic philosophies. The chapters in this volume grapple with the fact that even as these new economic and social orders undermine traditional patriarchies, they often introduce novel hierarchies. To identify the gendered impact of contemporary capitalist globalization, the case studies explore how globalization processes intersect with various, often preexisting, forms of social inequality. They cite evidence of how such inequalities are inevitably exacerbated by globalization and reproduce existing patterns of subordination along gendered axes. These case analyses also document how the unfolding of these processes impacts the realms of culture and morality, politics and discipline, labor and economy.

The ethnographic insights collected here suggest that women are intimately affected by the intensification of economic deprivation and widening income disparities ushered in by economic globalization in its current form(s), contrary to globalization's promise of poverty reduction and prosperity. Trade liberalization, for example, the cornerstone of the current regime of globalization, is promoted with the stated goal of reducing poverty and bringing about prosperity and freedom in the global South. Yet, volumes of evidence indicate that the power differentials inherent in the organization of global trade and production are being deepened, reified, and even justified in the practical unfolding of neoliberal economic policies. Those who are most affected by these policies are often individuals with the least to say about their implementation and about how and where these will unfold in both the global North and South. Hence women, particularly those already occupying marginal social locations, are inevitably entangled in the related processes of disempowerment.

As Naples points out, "feminist scholars offer insights into the contradictions associated with globalization by exploring how gender, sexuality, racialization, and region are mobilized to reinscribe differences through market relations" (Naples 2002:9). This volume builds on the concern expressed by Naples and many others, that racially and ethnically marked women are disproportionately subjected to economic and social dislocations. Accordingly, the primary focus of this volume is to document the encounters with transnational capitalist relations by low-income women situated at the margins of racialized, ethnic, class, caste, and regional hierarchies, women who often lack strong political representation of their interests. In addition to discussing the shifting demarcations of class, race, color, ethnicity, caste, age, and regional location, and the heightened marginality these confer, we explore women's agentive acts in their efforts to overcome such marginality.

 COPYRIGHTED MATERIAL www.sarpress.sarweb.org

NAVIGATION AND AGENCY

The chapters in this volume are grounded in the formative work of feminist anthropologists on the significance of women's agency (Ahearn 2001; Collier 1974) in engaging in resistance practices that challenge and subvert their marginalization and subordination (for example, Naples and Desai 2002; Rowbotham and Linkogle 2001; and many others). We reference the concept of "navigation" to capture the nuanced ways in which women of diverse social locations and identities (ethnic, racial, indigenous, caste, class, religious, and political affiliations and as formed at the intersection of these identity designations) exercise their personal and collective agency in resisting and challenging the disempowering aspects of globalization they encounter and experience.[12] Although the concept of agency is a pivotal one in gender and women's studies theorizing, given its significance for overcoming various forms of subordination, many transnational feminists (for example, Abu Lughod 1998; Fernandes 1997; Sunder-Rajan 1993) have helped us better understand how agency is far more complicated than a mere assertion of self-empowering will. Benería (2003:55–56) points out that assumptions of boundless agency may be traced to rational choice theory. Feminists, through a critical lens, have seen that not everyone is as free to choose among options as the "rational economic man," which ran so freely through so many classrooms and boardrooms in the last half of the twentieth century.

Our use of the concept of navigation also refers to the understanding that agency may not be conceived as a priori or as instantaneous, all-transforming, autonomous actions, but rather, as Butler (1999) has urged, that agency is revealed via inquiry into the conditions of its possibility. As such, the chapters in this volume explore and document the complex, contradictory, and controversial aspects of agency as the subjects of our inquiry often challenge the gendered power systems that subordinate them, sometimes registering a seeming accommodation to such power structures and sometimes displaying ambivalence toward them. Our concern in this volume is to add a nuanced understanding of agency in a way that allows room for a recognition of how, in many instances, women's agency may often be restricted by the cultural, social, and economic constraints and contradictions that undermine its potential for enactment, particularly in the ways in which current processes of globalization yield a gendered impact. The ethnographic chapters may be read for the ways in which marginalized women perceive and manage the constraints to, and possibilities of, their own agency.

An abundant body of scholarly work highlights the increased feminization

COPYRIGHTED MATERIAL www.sarpress.sarweb.org

of local and global labor forces and women's transnational activism in response to the numerous forms of economic and social disempowerment.13 This volume augments that corpus of research with ethnographic cases that illustrate the explanatory power of gender as a conceptual paradigm for understanding how local-global patriarchies collude with the operations of transnational capital in gendering globalization—although we see these relationships as being much more complex than a binary model of patriarchal capitalist oppression and resistance to it. In this manner, we are currently witnessing a moment in which women in the global South are able to exercise their social agency in an effort to challenge traditional forms of patriarchy and emerging forms of subordination imposed by "new" forms of patriarchy inherent in the workings of late-modern capital. Moreover, the expanded opportunities for transnational social action in a globalized world have created space for women's individual and collective resistance practices. In the ongoing violence after September 11, 2001 ("9/11"), women have also increasingly positioned themselves as community strategists, engaging issues that now have local and global relevance, including global peace movements, in ways that social scientists must better understand.

Within this volume, our collective aim is for readers to engage with both the analyses of the researchers authoring each chapter and with the analyses of the marginalized women to whom they listened. The epistemological project advanced by this volume is not simply to talk *about* how women navigate cultural and economic marginalities, but also to—as we have stated—provide a milieu in which those women narrate their own (however constrained) agentive acts and analyses. We take very seriously the critiques that charge that the words of already marginalized individuals are further exploited and commodified through ethnographic projects such as ours. We ask readers to consider the analyses of globalization offered in these pages by women who face various forms of marginalization to be just as salient as more privileged academic analyses. Thus, the examples of marginalized women's narratives of their experiences in this volume not only illustrate the complex dynamics of capitalist globalization but also represent a specific epistemological argument. In sum, marginalized women are not discussed in this volume as passive objects under the ethnographic lens, but as active collaborators in epistemological engagements of complex and multidimensional capitalist processes increasing inequities in global-local contexts.

NARRATIVES OF MULTIPLE ENCOUNTERS WITH GLOBALIZATION

With that epistemological project in view, we foreground the narratives of women navigating cultural and economic marginalities woven through-

 COPYRIGHTED MATERIAL www.sarpress.sarweb.org

out the ethnographic essays in this book, reflecting junctures and disjunctures in their experiences. By following the threads of the narratives of these and other women in this collection, readers can trace cross-regional differences and similarities in the gendered experiences of globalization. The comments by Dammi and Manike, the garment workers in Sri Lanka's export processing zones, for example, resonate with those by Cherry, Jovita, Mila, and other domestic workers in Los Angeles and Rome on their subjective experiences of marginality in city spaces. Their positioning and incorporation in diverse transnational labor processes (seemingly a result of choice, but also determined by the impoverishing effects of structural adjustment policies and the gendering of low-wage and care work) reflect a not too dissimilar subjection to the structural violence evidenced in Mary and Louise's experiences of domestic violence in the United States as compounded by city, state, and federal policies. The diverse ways in which these women are racialized, and thereby encounter compounded forms of disempowerment (at the intersections of race, class, caste, ethnic, and geographic locations), are echoed in the narratives of the Kond tribal woman, Sandhyarani Naik; Sybil, the tourism entrepreneur in Jamaica; Wanja, the Thai immigrant who operates a small business in Sweden; and Saraswati, the Tamil tea plucker in Sri Lanka. Their experiences inform us of the emerging discourses and frameworks sprouted in globalized contexts that help construct their marginality. For example, Sandhyarani Naik and other Kond women discuss how they navigate nationalist policies such as *swadeshi*, framed around Hinduizing (*Hindutva*) concepts of belonging that impose exclusionary practices on tribal people. Dammi, Manike, and other garment workers reflect on their nonbelonging in the class hierarchy of cosmopolitan Colombo, the reduction of their identities to unskilled workers, and their transgressive acts in response.

The reflections by women in these ethnographic case studies on their strategies of resistance show that agentive acts are empowering from a subjective perspective even when they are unlikely to transform the oppressive material realities that constrain women in their encounters with globalization processes. Sybil decides to reestablish the family business in a manner that could well compete with larger, better funded hotel chains (and successfully develops a strategy to do so). Ghanaian female traders like Sisi, who represent a long historical tradition of female trading in West Africa, take up transnational trading as a means of surviving the compressive effects of structural adjustment and, equally important, find ways to take advantage of trade liberalization policies. The women in this volume also ruminate on the varied impacts of neoliberal policies on their survival

COPYRIGHTED MATERIAL www.sarpress.sarweb.org

capacities and social positioning. Diana and Dot, in Mexico and the United States, for example, offer their analyses of NAFTA, which may be compared with Saraswati's narrative about SAFTA. Similarly, Eva, Mona, and other women in rural Sweden critique the contradictory effects of EU gender equity policies on their local context. Wanja discusses her characterization as a Thai immigrant in Sweden and how EU economic policies affect her small business operation. Cherry, Jovita, Mila, and other domestic workers reflect on the ways in which immigration policies in Los Angeles and Rome are implicated in and aggravate the xenophobia they encounter in these cities. Vilma Campos and Anthony Lee draw connections between US policy in El Salvador and the Asian financial crisis and their experiences of marginality as transnational workers in the hotel and restaurant industry in San Francisco. The manner in which their physical bodies bear the strains and stresses of globalization is evident in the latter narratives, as well as those of Luz, Candela, Fanny, Luna, and Alondra in Argentina, who contribute vital insights on the impact of longer working hours but decreased standards of living ushered in by Argentina's economic crisis.

Some of the insights provided by women marginalized in globalization are offered through material discourses (and discussions of them), as in what the cloth displayed by women at funerals in Liberia represents, shedding light on the history of colonization, offshore European textile production, migrant labor, and import-export policies that are part of the longer history of globalization. Collectively, they represent the tensions evident in the disempowering social and material consequences of globalization that women experience in diverse locations in the global North and South and their strategic acts of agency. Implicit in these strategic engagements is a call for a collective, transnational response to globalization, as voiced by Saraswati, the Tamil tea plucker in Sri Lanka.

ETHNOGRAPHIC INSIGHTS ON GENDERED MARGINALITY

The ethnographic essays in this volume augment the existing literature on globalization by providing vivid accounts of women's diverse experiences in globalized social contexts and by making space for the voices of women in globalized contexts to narrate their own particular experiences. We bring together multidisciplinary ethnographic documentation by scholars positioned socially and physically at many global locations, acknowledging both the situatedness and partiality of knowledge (see Collins 1991), as Lamphere, Ragone, and Zavella (1997) have emphasized in their collection. In terms of methodology, we provide a space for recognizing the diversity

 COPYRIGHTED MATERIAL www.sarpress.sarweb.org

of voices and perspectives as a critical way to avoid the erasure of difference in the production of knowledge, as Mohanty (1991, 2003a), Collins (1991), Hurtado (1996), Hale (1991), Brah (2003), and Sandoval (2003) have cautioned against. Methodologically, we agree with Burawoy and others (2000) and Williams (1996) that we need to ground our analyses of globalization in documentation of the connections between our everyday milieux and transnational processes (as with the analysis of the labor conditions in the hotels where anthropology meetings are held). We bring together ethnographic evidence that traces the numerous processes and factors instrumental in the exacerbation of marginality and disempowerment in the operations of globalization along the contours of gender.

A number of scholars have called for anthropological analyses of globalization (see, for example, Kearney 1995; Tsing 2000) and of capitalism (Blim 2000) that draw on the close observational and listening skills of ethnography to document the variously situated interpretations and experiences of globalized capitalism(s), and for specific attention to gender in relation to globalization (see Freeman 2001; Yelin 2004). The proliferation of the ethnographic method into other disciplinary domains speaks to its powerful capacity to capture the complex dynamics of social relations. As the various disciplinary analyses represented in this volume attest, ethnographic methods are not necessarily the exclusive province of anthropologists. Sociologist Ali Rattansi (2005:287) has noted the particular usefulness of ethnographic approaches, or "thick descriptions," in understanding "the lived experience of racialized interactions." Moreover, sociologist Raka Ray's (2003:110) essay on what she learned from listening to a domestic worker, Lakshmi, about her life and work in Calcutta, points out the importance of listening to what women say about their circumstances and also to the silences of what women do *not* say. In this regard, the ethnographic vantage point of this volume not only puts marginalized women of color at center stage but also allows for the amplification of their voices. As Aguilar (2004:16) argues, "to speak of globalization without center-staging women of color would be a grave mistake." Finally, echoing the persistent concerns with gender essentialism and representation that women's studies and anthropology have long engaged, the ethnographic descriptions also capture the diversity in women's encounters with globalization and the unique and often parallel dimensions of inequities that configure their lives.

POINTS OF DEPARTURE AND CONVERGENCE

This volume represents the culmination of a two-year effort devoted to the theme of women and globalization by the Association for Feminist

COPYRIGHTED MATERIAL www.sarpress.sarweb.org

Anthropology (AFA), launched during Lynn Bolles' (2002–2004) term as president and continued under Mary Anglin's term as president (2004–2006). As part of this effort, AFA members compiled bibliographies and syllabi, mentored students, and organized sessions at the annual meetings of the American Anthropological Association (AAA) (2003). Many of the chapters in this volume are drawn from a panel on women and globalization ("The Other Side of Peace: Women and Globalization"),[14] organized by Lynn Bolles and Nandini Gunewardena at the 2003 annual meetings of the AAA. Several chapters were recruited from the session "Global Apartheid, Environmental Degradation, and Women's Actions for Sustainable Well-Being," organized by Faye Harrison for the 2004 meetings of the International Congress of Anthropological and Ethnological Sciences (ICAES). This collection brings together essays on women's experiences in several globalized social contexts in the global South, including Ghana, India, Jamaica, Liberia, Mexico, the Philippines, and Sri Lanka, as well as comparative analyses of marginalized regions and sectors of the global North (for example, the US South, a rural Swedish district, and service work in California and Rome). The collection represents a transnational and interdisciplinary collaboration among scholars from five continents in the global North and South.

We are indebted to the School for Advanced Research (SAR) for extending the funding support that made it possible for a group of senior feminist scholars to convene on the SAR campus in April 2005 to engage in extensive discussions about the nature and scope of the book. Thanks to the foresight and flexibility of SAR Press co-director Catherine Cocks, we were able to depart from the usual week-long seminar format required by the SAR for book projects.[15] In our case, ten project advisers (including several past presidents of the AFA) corresponded virtually about the ethnographic chapters already assembled and then met on the SAR campus for condensed discussions establishing themes for additional essays. The participants included Mary Anglin (then president of the AFA), Lynn Bolles, Karen Brodkin, Catherine Cocks, Nandini Gunewardena, Faye Harrison, Ann Kingsolver, Louise Lamphere, Mary Moran, Sandi Morgen, and Patricia Zavella.

The seminar enabled us to discuss the contributions of feminist and ethnographic perspectives to political economic analyses of globalization. One of our concerns was to incorporate diverse perspectives on unique and parallel experiences of globalization processes by women in different social and spatial locations. We reached a consensus that it was imperative to allow the voices of culturally and economically marginalized women to resonate critically throughout the text via the ethnographic documenta-

 COPYRIGHTED MATERIAL www.sarpress.sarweb.org

tion of the individual authors, who, themselves, embody such diverse social and spatial locations.[16] We also agreed that this volume must avoid naturalizing women's participation in globalization and analyze critically how local and global gender constructions may collide in the ways women experience globalization processes. Our aim is to contribute to a more nuanced understanding of women's social locations at, and navigation of, the intersections of racial, ethnic, class, caste, indigenous, and other markers of marginality.[17]

From the start, this volume has been rooted in a political economic analysis of women's specifically gendered locations and actions in relation to the current dynamics of global geopolitics and reflecting a multitude of power relationships—in households, communities, organizations, nations, and transnational contexts. As a project of the Association for Feminist Anthropology, this volume brings to broader political economic discussions of globalization particular attention to the subjective voices of those marginalized from, and by, academic privilege and critiques naturalized categories, colonial, patriarchal, and white lenses, and entitlement. The construction and negotiation of culture is also a tenet of ethnographic analyses brought to the volume, but we wanted to emphasize—in focusing on how women navigate particular marginalities—the constraints on agency, as well as the possibilities for women experiencing convergent forms of oppression with capitalist globalizations.

STRUCTURE OF THE VOLUME

This book may be read and used in a number of ways, but we have organized the chapters by clustering them according to thematic concerns that encourage readers to take up the discussions begun by the authors. The first cluster, for example, focuses on production, distribution, and consumption—in this case, of cloth and clothing—as central to current and historical analyses of globalization. In the section "Producing Threads, Consuming Garb: Women Traversing Global Clothing Markets," Nandini Gunewardena's chapter focuses on women workers in a garment factory in Sri Lanka; Akosua Darkwah discusses women trading cloth in the transnational market between Europe and Ghana; and Mary Moran considers the shifting meanings of cloth and its consumption in Liberia from the colonial period. This cluster facilitates discussion of the gendering of globalizations through a focus on commodity chains and the lives connected through those chains (see Collins 2003).

The second cluster of chapters, "Racialized Policies, Scarred Bodies: Women Transposing Neoliberal Violence," documents the dichotomous

COPYRIGHTED MATERIAL www.sarpress.sarweb.org

categories that have fostered the hierarchical racialization, subordination, and paternalistic marginalization of groups of people through capitalist economic and cultural relations. This cluster also allows readers to look critically at the ways in which historical, development, and neoliberal discourses are used to promote and mask active marginalization, including physical violence. The chapters in this section are Ulrika Dahl's discussion of marginality related to nationality and gender in rural Sweden, William Conwill's analysis of domestic violence and economic marginality in the United States, and Barbara Sutton's documentation of the embodied effects of neoliberal policies on women facing harsher working conditions and less access to food and health care.

The third section, "Servicing Leisure, Serving Class: Women Transgressing Global Circuits of Care," focuses on service work as a lens to study women's marginalities, and their contestation of these, in global circuits. Lynn Bolles discusses women workers and entrepreneurs in the tourist sector in Jamaica; Rhacel Parreñas focuses on domestic workers from the Philippines who navigate urban spaces in the United States and Italy; and Sandy Smith-Nonini writes about the union activism of workers from many nations who service San Francisco's hotel and restaurant industry, which hosts groups such as the American Anthropological Association.

The last cluster of ethnographic essays, "Contesting Marginalities, Imagining Alternatives: Women Transforming Global Coalitions," focuses on something that all the chapters in the volume address—agency in relation to conditions associated with economic globalization. Ann Kingsolver's chapter includes a discussion of the conceptual contributions of women's plurinational organizing to broader alliances against neoliberal free trade policies in Latin America. Annapurna Pandey looks at the use of the concept *swadeshi* by women in India to resist negative aspects of globalization in their regions.

The foreword, chapter 2, and the concluding chapters introduce other ways of reading across and beyond the collected ethnographic essays, taking up the themes of structure and agency, the role of states, the paradoxes of globalization, processes of differentiation, patriarchal capitalist and other power relations, and ethnographic and coalitional approaches to understanding gendered globalizations and how women navigate economic and cultural marginalities.

The authors engage theories of cultural and economic marginalization that bridge political economic, feminist, critical race theory, and other approaches to discuss individual and collective experiences of power that distinguish among agency, autonomy, and hegemony. We examine expres-

 COPYRIGHTED MATERIAL www.sarpress.sarweb.org

sions of agentive, oppositional discourse and strategies for alternative knowledge practices and political mobilization to contribute to theoretical analyses of marginalization, vulnerability, and social exclusion in relation to economic globalization.

About the Authors

Nandini Gunewardena is a practitioner anthropologist with a Ph.D. from the University of California, Los Angeles. She has more than 14 years of pragmatic experience addressing the concerns of women in several impoverished nations in Asia and more recently the Middle East and North Africa through her work with a number of bi- and multilateral agencies. Her expertise includes community-based research, project implementation, outcome assessments, and policy reform. She returned to academia in 1998, teaching in the departments of anthropology, women's studies, and international development studies at the University of California, Los Angeles. She is currently a faculty member in the human services program at Western Washington University. Her ongoing research focuses on the inequities generated by neoliberal globalization (including the feminization of poverty), women's work in transnational factories, and suicide as a response to economic stressors.

Ann Kingsolver, associate professor of anthropology at the University of South Carolina, has been interviewing men and women about their views on globalization since 1986 in the United States, Mexico, and, most recently, Sri Lanka. She wrote *NAFTA Stories: Fears and Hopes in Mexico and the United States* (2001) and edited *More Than Class: Studying Power in US Workplaces* (1998). She is general editor of the *Anthropology of Work Review.*

Notes

1. Kaufman (2003:153) notes that the "acceptance of oppression as natural and normal by oppressed and oppressor alike is especially striking in the gender-based forms of oppression." Attention to this problem by feminist theorists has enabled us to recognize other forms of naturalization, as in capitalist market rationality being seen as "natural" or "logical."

2. We acknowledge here that there is a separate literature on vulnerability, which those interested in marginalities might want to investigate critically. Kirby (2006:11), for example, argues that discussions of vulnerability by organizations such as the World Bank need to be expanded to include explicit attention to violence. Authors in and beyond this volume have also addressed the physical violence of neoliberal policies, for example.

COPYRIGHTED MATERIAL www.sarpress.sarweb.org

3. See Lamphere, Ragoné, and Zavella 1997 (pp. 451–469) for more on this concept.

4. As Bergeron (2001:991) notes, "many feminist accounts of globalization remain partly inscribed within mainstream discourses of economic and political space even as they are reconfiguring them." In this volume, the state and capital are not viewed as monolithic, but as experienced and configured differently, thus our use of plural globalizations.

5. See, for example, Basu et al. 2001; Channa 2004; di Leonardo 1991; Harrison 2002, 2004b; Lamphere, Ragoné, and Zavella 1997; Lancaster and di Leonardo 1997; Ong 2000; Ortner and Whitehead 1981.

6. Feminist analysis itself has multiple strands. See Hawkesworth 2006 (pp. 25–28) for an excellent history of plural feminisms. Moraga (2002) has referred to an "expanded feminism" to acknowledge the shift beyond the narrow roots of feminist analysis in a predominantly white and "First World" context.

7. See, for example, Aguilar and Lacsamana 2004; Balakrishnan 2002; Benería 2003; Bolles 1996a; Fernandez-Kelly 1997; Harrison 1997a; Kingfisher 2002; Ong 1987; Piven et al. 2002; Safa 1995; Wolf 1992.

8. Sassen (2006:16–17) discusses how "in the 1980s and 1990s, the growth in FDI took place through the internationalization of production of goods and services, and of portfolio investment (buying firms)."

9. Hawkesworth (2006:3) discusses well the situated effects of globalization on women "within particular races, classes, ethnicities and nationalities"; other projects are also closely allied with ours in this volume. The ethnographic examples collected here are intended to contribute particularly to that shared project.

10. Barker and Feiner (2004:2) describe a feminist economic approach as reframing economic questions and priorities: "Neoclassical economics insists on seeing each as essentially the same: they are all rational economic agents seeking to maximize their utility within the dual constraints of time and income. The feminist alternative holds that gender, race, ethnicity, and nation are analytical categories, not mere descriptors attached to rational agents who are in all other regards identical" (Barker and Feiner 2004:5).

11. We use the term *global South* to refer to the shared vulnerabilities experienced by developing nations that have been drawn into neoliberal globalization processes in oppressive and disempowering ways, and in solidarity with "South–South" collaborative efforts to bring about social justice and equity. We are cognizant of the parallel vulnerabilities that exist within pockets of the global North, to the extent that they may be included in our framing of the global South. In similar fashion, we recognize that sources of oppression operant across the globe collude in constituting the marginalities and disempowerment in this wider notion of the global South.

12. As Chang (2004:231) points out, women of color have been most affected by capitalist globalization because of its extension of earlier forms of marginalization; sev-

 COPYRIGHTED MATERIAL www.sarpress.sarweb.org

eral of the ethnographic essays in this volume include historical analyses precisely because of the compound, gendered effect of earlier forms of oppression.

13. See, for example, Keating 2004; Kelly et al. 2001; Marchand and Runyan 2000; Naples and Desai 2002; Rowbotham and Linkogle 2001; Staudt, Rai, and Parpart 2002.

14. The AAA theme for 2003 was organized under the rubric of "Peace: Affinities, Divisions, and Transformations." In coining the title for that session, we drew upon the phrase in the much respected Palestinian human rights activist and scholar Hanan Ashrawi's book *This Side of Peace* to capture the troubling aspects of globalization for women.

15. We are grateful to Catherine Cocks for her vision and support of this volume and to Ann Perramond for her insightful copyediting.

16. We agree with Arturo Escobar (1995:223), who has argued that ethnography is not the only way to investigate alternatives to capitalist modernities but that it is vital to attend ethnographically to insights from those most affected by hegemonic configurations, outside academic contexts.

17. There is a vast literature on intersectional approaches. Cindi Katz, for example, has used the term *topography* as "grounded by translocal politics [that] offers at the very least the possibility of countering the ways that the maneuvers of globalized capitalism exacerbate and build upon gendered, racialized, nationalist, and class axes of oppression and inequality in different historical geographies" (Katz 2001:1231).

COPYRIGHTED MATERIAL www.sarpress.sarweb.org